

MELBOURNE AIRPORT COMMUNITY AVIATION CONSULTATION GROUP
Minutes, Open meeting—Tuesday 15 November 2016, 7pm–8.30pm
Jack McKenzie Community Centre, Green Street, Bulla

Present

(CACG members):

Darrell Treloar	Independent Chair
David O'Connor	Community
Susan Jennison OAM	Community
Frank Rivoli	Community
Michael Sharp	Australian Mayoral Aviation Council
Cr Jack Medcraft	Australian Mayoral Aviation Council
Liz Beattie	Victorian Trades Hall Council (proxy for Luke Hilakari)
Henry Bezuidenhout	Local Government Officer (Moonee Valley)

(Organisational / agency representatives)

Michael Jarvis	Melbourne Airport
Anna Gillett	Melbourne Airport
Alby Goodsell	Airservices Australia
Neil Hall	Airservices Australia
Cameron Rimington	Commonwealth Department of Infrastructure and Regional Development

(Supporting subject matter experts / support staff):

Kerr Forbes	Melbourne Airport
Trent Kneebush	Melbourne Airport
Tim Gill	Melbourne Airport
Renee Atkinson	Melbourne Airport
Melanie Hearne	Melbourne Airport
Kris Perkovic	Melbourne Airport
Caroline Doherty	Melbourne Airport
Kristi High	Melbourne Airport
Helen Love	Melbourne Airport
Robert Quigley	Director, Quigley and Watts

Apologies:

Damian Spencer	Pilot, Virgin Australia
----------------	-------------------------

Jane Homewood	Victorian Department of Environment, Land, Water and Planning.
Mateja Rautner	Community
Leanne Deans	Noise Abatement Committee
Bob Baggio	Local Government Officer (Melton)
Carly Dixon	Melbourne Airport

Number of public in attendance: 19

1. Welcome and introductions—Darrell Treloar, Chair

The Chair welcomed everyone to the meeting and introduced Cr Jack Medcraft, a Hume City Councillor, attending his first meeting as the Australian Mayoral Aviation Council (AMAC) representative to the CACG.

Cr Medcraft has replaced Adem Atmaca, who was not returned as councillor at the recent local government elections. The Chair also acknowledged:

- Cameron Rimington, of the Commonwealth Department of Infrastructure and Regional Development (DIRD), attending on behalf of Marcelo Alves.
- Robert Quigley, Director with consultancy Quigley and Watts, presenting on the project scope for the Runway Development program Health Impact Assessment.

The Chair advised that meetings of the CACG are recorded for the purpose of assisting with the preparation of draft minutes. The recordings are deleted once the minutes have been endorsed by this group at the next quarterly meeting.

2. Apologies

The Chair noted the members that had provided apologies (as above).

3. Confirmation of Minutes of meeting held on 16 August 2016

The Chair referred to the minutes from the CACG meeting held on Tuesday 16 August 2016 from 7pm to 8:30pm at the Gladstone Park Senior Citizens Centre, corner Carrick Drive and Elmhurst Street, Gladstone Park

It was **AGREED** that minutes of the meeting held on Tuesday 16 August 2016 be confirmed as an accurate representation of the meeting.

4. Reports

4.1 CACG Pre-meeting, Summary report—Darrell Treloar, independent Chair

Darrell Treloar provided a summary report on the key items of discussion from the pre-meeting of CACG members held from 4pm to 6pm. This included:

- Adoption of a recruitment procedure
- Fixing meeting dates and venues for 2017 and 2018
- Presentation on RDP: Health Impact Assessment

- Recommendations to Melbourne Airport and Airservices regarding noise abatement procedures
 - Review of CACG meeting format trial
- (Refer to CACG pre-meeting minutes for more information.) This report was **NOTED**.

4.2 Melbourne Airport report—Michael Jarvis, Melbourne Airport

The Melbourne Airport report was presented, with the following key highlights:

- 2016 Melbourne Airport Stakeholder Report.
- Surf Park project update.
- Melbourne Airport community engagement
- Planning update.
- New airline and route announcements.
- September passenger numbers.
- Environment update.
- RDP studies update.

For detailed information, refer to the CACG Melbourne Airport pre-meeting report attached with the minutes. This report was **NOTED**.

5. Presentation: Runway Development Program Health Impact Assessment—Robert Quigley, Director, Quigley and Watts

Robert Quigley, a public health specialist and the lead consultant for the RDP Health Impact Assessment gave a presentation to the public meeting, outlining the scope of the assessment. The presentation was similar to one given to CACG members at the pre-meeting earlier in the day.

Mr Quigley emphasised that the Health Impact Assessment would consider both the positive and negative impacts of the RDP on the community, and took questions from members of the public in attendance on both the scope and the type of data to be collected to inform the assessment.

It was reiterated that findings of the Health Impact Assessment will be made available to the community, as with the other RDP studies.

Dennis Ruggiero:

Has Melbourne Airport given you the air quality and noise levels on the current east-west runway to the east?

Robert Quigley:

Robert Quigley stated noise and air quality data is being provided by Melbourne Airport.

Elaine Whalley:

With given information there has been no indication about human analysis relating to health. Are there statistics being gathered?

Robert Quigley:

Robert Quigley reiterated that a number of datasets would be used to inform the health impact assessment.

6. Submissions / Questions from the public

Dennis Ruggiero

1. *As part of the Tullamarine Freeway widening project, on the Pascoe Vale Road turnoff, CityLink has moved classrooms and noise insulated and double glazed windows at Strathmore Secondary College, even at this early stage. Why is the Melbourne Airport not doing anything for the schools in Gladstone Park to safeguard the quality of education for all who attend?*

Michael Jarvis, Melbourne Airport:

Michael Jarvis stated that Melbourne Airport is not considering any noise insulation scheme. There was previously an Australian Government funded noise insulation program in Sydney and Adelaide. In these two locations, residential properties within the 30 Australian Noise Exposure Forecast (ANEF) contour were eligible for an insulation grant for their properties.

2. *Can I make a recommendation that the CACG address the education issue with Melbourne Airport should the proposed third runway go ahead?*

Michael Jarvis, Melbourne Airport:

As was highlighted in the presentation from Robert Quigley, the Health Impact Assessment will consider the noise effects on cognitive tasks in schoolchildren. Findings from that study will be published on the Melbourne Airport website and made available to the community.

3. *Before I ask this question, I would like to quote a statement that was made by Commissioner Smith on 12 March 1991 re: the Civil Aviation Authority: In relation to the concept of consultation I wish to make it clear that this involves more than a mere exchange of information. For consultation to be effective the participants must be contributing to the decision making process not only in appearance but in fact. As a participant, when will Melbourne Airport begin consultation in its true and correct form with myself and the other participants of the communities that will be severely impacted should the third runway development proceed?*

Anna Gillett, Melbourne Airport:

Anna Gillett explained that Melbourne Airport's community engagement thus far has focused on raising awareness of the RDP in addition to publicising other key projects such as the surf park and international terminal developments. As study findings are released in 2017, the airport will engage the community on the studies and explain what the findings have to say, whether good, bad or indifferent.

4. *When will the community be provided with alternative times and venues to raise their issues and concerns with Melbourne Airport as they are currently hiding behind the façade that an information stand manned between the hours of 11am and 3pm Monday to Friday at the Gladstone Park Shopping Centre constitutes as community consultation?*

Anna Gillett, Melbourne Airport:

Anna Gillett reiterated that as the study findings become available, there will be multiple opportunities available to the community to engage with Melbourne Airport. New times and venues were currently being considered as part of the engagement program moving forward.

Ross Hoysted

5. *Air traffic has moved closer to Oaklands Road north of Somerton Road in the last 18 months and noise levels have increased substantially. Can you explain why? We are 200 metres north of the junction of Somerton Road.*

Neil Hall, Airservices Australia:

Aiservices provided an undertaking to look into the complaint and report back to Mr Hoysted through the NCIS.

Apollo Yianni

6. *What suburbs have noise monitors?*

Neil Hall, Airservices Australia:

Airservices maintains noise monitors at locations near the airport. These locations provide noise data as expressed in decibels, which can be viewed on Airservices' Webtrak site.

Apollo Yianni

7. *What suburbs have air quality monitors?*

Michael Jarvis, Melbourne Airport:

Michael Jarvis explained that Melbourne Airport maintained several air monitoring units in locations near the airport:

- Melbourne Airport South Station located on airport land due south of the north–south runway
- Keilor Village Retirement Home
- Living Legends at Greenvale
- Westmeadows Football Club (installed but not yet functioning)

Apollo Yianni

8. *Who else monitors noise/air quality?*

Michael Jarvis, Melbourne Airport:

At a state level, the Environment Protection Authority has responsibility for air quality monitoring.

Apollo Yianni

9. *Who takes responsibility for illness caused by poor quality air? Who takes responsibility for health effects? Melbourne Airport? State Government?*

Michael Jarvis, Melbourne Airport:

Michael Jarvis noted that ultimately it was the responsibility of state and federal government as regulators for air quality.

Apollo Yianni

10. *Flight paths over East Keilor substation. Have you done any studies for failure caused by aircraft?*

Darrell Treloar, independent Chair:

Chair noted this was asked at a previous CACG meeting and a detailed answer provided. The Chair suggested Mr Yianni speak offline to Melbourne Airport staff should he require further information.

Steve Ducie

11. *With the recent Council elections, will there be a representative from Hume on the CACG?*

Darrell Treloar, Independent Chair

Councillor Jack Medcraft is from Hume Council (and represents the Australian Mayoral Aviation Council). Cr Medcraft replaces Adem Atmaca (as noted in Item 1)

Steve Ducie

12. *Is there any work being undertaken in regards to the impacts on property values from the third runway?*

Michael Jarvis, Melbourne Airport:

Michael Jarvis explained that a property study was being undertaken that examined the impact of aircraft noise on residential property values and that this study would form part of the Economic Impact Assessment. He noted similar studies had been undertaken for Brisbane and Gold Coast Airports.

Steve Ducie

13. *What is the projected revenue and profit outcomes of the proposed new runway?*

Michael Jarvis, Melbourne Airport:

Michael Jarvis declined to provide an amount or to speculate on the business case for the project.

Steve Ducie

14. *What is Melbourne Airport doing about noise mitigation for residents that are going to be affected by the third runway. Who is responsible for noise mitigation?*

Michael Jarvis, Melbourne Airport:

Michael Jarvis reiterated that Melbourne Airport is not considering any noise insulation scheme and that previous programs had been funded by the Australian Government. Regarding noise abatement in general, Melbourne Airport is not a planning authority but works with local and state planning authorities to minimise noise impacts by encouraging 'compatible land uses' such as industrial and commercial development both around the airport and under flight paths. While past planning decisions have allowed encroachment, the airport has been advocating strongly in opposing developments near flight paths that would create noise issues for future residents.

Annette McCoy

15. *My question is about the re-siting of mail collection boxes from the Virgin end of the terminal to a spot near the T4 carpark? Who made this decision and can it be reinstated at the Virgin terminal?*

Michael Jarvis asked Caroline Doherty, Melbourne Airport, to respond:

Caroline Doherty confirmed it was a decision of Australia Post to relocate the mail collection boxes to Terminal 4.

Annette McCoy

16. *The cost of car parking is outrageous. I was only 30 seconds over for the first hour but still managed to be charged the amount for the second hour. Let's be user friendly and more welcoming to guests.*

Anna Gillett, Melbourne Airport:

Regarding car park bookings, it was recommended that customers booked online for the best deals.

Darren Buttigieg

17. *Arrivals and departures constantly fly over Foster Road, Keilor Park and not 600m to the west, which is where it's meant to be. Why can't the airlines stick to their flightpaths instead of flying over half a kilometre off it?*

Neil Hall, Airservices Australia:

Neil Hall explained that he personally undertook an investigation from the August CACG meeting to determine if the flight path, as requested by the Buttigieg family, could be moved to a more industrial area in Keilor Park. That investigation found that it was not possible to move the flight path.

Neil Hall then stated that the query regarding Fosters Road is different to the previous query as it relates to aircraft not flying on the designated flight path. Neil Hall offered to follow up on this query and report back to the Buttigieg family through the NCIS.

Rodney Watt

18. *We are fed up with the false promises and stall tactics being used by the CACG team in the hope we will give up and go away. I am here to tell you "We will not go away. We are all fed up with the CACG team's refusal to provide answers to the same questions that have been asked at nearly every meeting since your meetings began. We are all fed up waiting for figures on noise and air pollution. You cannot tell us that it takes 18 months or longer to take these readings and expect us to take you seriously. Airservices Australia and the EPA would almost certainly know what the figures would look like but one has to ask why they are remaining silent.*

Could it be that the owners of the airport already know the figures to be outside the allowable limits and are colluding with the federal government and other organisations to prevent the truth being made public in an effort to push through to completion? It is my view that it is highly probable. Could it be that these organisations already know there will be a significant risk to the health of thousands of residents under the flight path of aircraft using this new runway but have been made powerless to protect us against the actions of the airport owners?

Could it be that the owners of the airport consider themselves to be a law unto themselves and as such has them believing it gives them the right to destroy the lives of so many, all in the name of profit to a private enterprise? The law is the law and we will also use it to protect ourselves.

Mr Watt's statement was noted.

19. *Could it be that Airservices Australia are turning a blind eye to the possibility of a mid air collision between air traffic on approach or taking off on the north-south runway at Essendon Airport and an aircraft on final to the new east-west at Tullamarine, or a catastrophic engine failure that could bring an aircraft down on a highly populated residential area?*

Alby Goodsell, Airservices Australia:

Alby Goodsell emphasised that safety is of utmost importance to the work of Airservices and that Airservices has procedures in place that are world's best practice, that it has one of the

best safety records in the world, that its air traffic controllers are well-trained and excellent at what they do, and that Airservices is well regulated by the Civil Aviation Safety Authority.

As regards to the interaction between Melbourne and Essendon airports, he stated that both airports were indeed in close proximity to each other but there was no risk of collision as the airspace was well managed and that all aircraft, whether it be an A380 or a Cessna arriving at Essendon received the same level of care and service from Airservices.

Rodney Watt

20. *To have a chairperson who has blatantly dismissed every one of our genuine concerns at every meeting just indicates to us all that he is performing his job at 100 per cent for his employer and is not interested in hearing anything we have to say other than reporting back to his employer for their tactical use. Finally, to have a chairperson who is employed and paid by the owners of the airport makes it impossible for the meeting to be unbiased despite the fact that he is expecting us all to believe otherwise and therefore must stand down and be replaced by someone who has no vested interest in the runway project.*

Darrell Treloar, independent Chair:

The Chair noted that he had previously fielded questions on this matter, which were on the public record. He reiterated that he is not an employee of Melbourne Airport but is employed as a consultant to chair the CACG and that it is a Commonwealth Government requirement that CACG chairs be remunerated by airport operators for the time they put in to the CACG. He added that if it was felt he was being unfair or impartial, he expected he would be told so by the Commonwealth Government, whose officers attend every CACG meeting as observers.

Elaine Whalley

21. *Noise levels: could there be an easier way to personally observe noise levels?*

Darrell Treloar, independent Chair:

The Chair stated there are apps available that enable users to take noise readings.

Elaine Whalley

22. *Why is there no direct Commonwealth government public liaison?*

Darrell Treloar, independent Chair:

The Chair stated that staff from the Commonwealth Government's Department of Infrastructure and Regional Development attended all Melbourne Airport CACG meetings as observers.

Malcolm Thompson

23. *Is the private jetbase operated by Mr Paul Little going to be a passenger or freight service?*

Michael Jarvis, Melbourne Airport:

Michael Jarvis stated that it was a passenger service for private business jet customers.

Malcolm Thompson

24. *I'm a gemologist and my job is with acids to work out minerals and I've been doing that for years. Robert (Quigley) talked about toluene, benzene, sulphur. Now when you are coming along the road, I ask you to look at the wire fence and you will see what toluene, benzene, sulphur is doing to the fence. I've been watching this for four years now and on certain days you will see how the fence is rusting out. My concern is that Westmeadows is one of the highest cancer areas in the place and I take people, two days per week usually, to Peter*

MacCallum Cancer Centre and most of the clients are coming from there. I would just like you to look at that the next time you are going past the airport.

Darrell Treloar, independent Chair:

The Chair thanked Mr Thompson for raising the matter.

Meeting closed at 9pm

Next meeting: to be held on Tuesday 21 February 2017 7pm–8.30pm at the Diggers Rest Community Hall, Diggers Rest Recreation Reserve, Plumpton Road, Diggers Rest