

MELBOURNE AIRPORT COMMUNITY AVIATION CONSULTATION GROUP

Minutes, Pre-meeting—Tuesday 21 February 2017, 4pm–6pm

Diggers Rest Community Hall, Diggers Rest Recreation Reserve, Plumpton Road, Diggers Rest

Present

(CACG members):

Darrell Treloar	Independent Chair
David O'Connor	Community
Susan Jennison OAM	Community
Frank Rivoli	Community
Capt Darren Gray	Pilot, Virgin Australia
Michael Sharp	Australian Mayoral Aviation Council
Cr Jack Medcraft	Australian Mayoral Aviation Council
Alison Glynn	Victorian Department of Environment, Land, Water and Planning (proxy for Jane Homewood)
Liz Beattie	Victorian Trades Hall Council (proxy for Luke Hilakari)
Henry Bezuidenhout	Local Government Officer (Moonee Valley)

(Organisational / agency representatives)

Michael Jarvis	Melbourne Airport
Anna Gillett	Melbourne Airport
Grant Smith	Melbourne Airport
Alby Goodsell	Airservices Australia
Neil Hall	Airservices Australia
Leonie Horrocks	Commonwealth Department of Infrastructure and Regional Development

(Supporting subject matter experts / support staff):

Kerr Forbes	Melbourne Airport
Rebecca Dickson	Melbourne Airport
Renee Atkinson	Melbourne Airport
Melanie Hearne	Melbourne Airport
Kris Perkovic	Melbourne Airport
Vicki Nesci	Melbourne Airport
Chris Eves	Professor of Property, School of Property, Construction & Project Management, RMIT

Apologies:

Jane Homewood	Victorian Department of Environment, Land, Water and Planning
Chris Cano	Commonwealth Department of Infrastructure and Regional Development
Cameron Rimington	Commonwealth Department of Infrastructure and Regional Development
Trent Kneebush	Melbourne Airport
Kristi High	Melbourne Airport
Caroline Doherty	Melbourne Airport

Opening statement: Essendon Airport aircraft accident Read by Darrell Treloar, Independent Chair

"Prior to commencing the meeting, I want to acknowledge the tragic accident which occurred at Essendon Airport this morning when a Beechcraft King Air aircraft, with five people aboard, crashed while attempting to return to the airport shortly after take-off.

It is understood all five lost their lives in the incident and I'm sure you will all join with me in expressing our condolences to the families concerned and everyone touched by this unfortunate occurrence. The circumstances of the accident will undoubtedly be fully investigated by the Australian Transport Safety Bureau and we will learn more in due course. But for now, our hearts and best wishes go out to those people affected, the emergency services people who responded and those who will do the clean up and recovery.

I invite you to stand and join with me in a moment of silence as we pay our respects to those who lost their lives."

All present stood and participated in a quiet period of reflection.

1. Welcome and introductions—Darrell Treloar, Chair

The Chair welcomed everyone to the meeting and introduced Alison Glynn, of the Victorian Department of Environment, Land, Water and Planning, attending as proxy for Jane Homewood.

The Chair also acknowledged:

- Leonie Horrocks, of the Commonwealth Department of Infrastructure and Regional Development (DIRD)
- Chris Eves, Professor of Property, at RMIT's School of Property, Construction & Project Management, presenting on the findings of the Property Values Study

The Chair advised that meetings of the CACG are recorded for the purpose of assisting with the preparation of draft minutes. The recordings are deleted once the minutes have been endorsed by this group at the next quarterly meeting.

2. Apologies

The Chair noted the members who had provided apologies (as above).

3. Confirmation of Minutes of meeting held on 15 November 2016

The Chair referred to the minutes from the CACG pre-meeting held on Tuesday 15 November 2016 from 4pm to 6pm at the Jack McKenzie Community Centre, Green Street, Bulla.

It was **AGREED** that minutes of the meeting be confirmed as an accurate representation of the meeting.

4. List items of other business (refer to Item 9 below)

- **David O'Connor:** Green Wedge coalition CACG membership; noise reporting
- **Jack Medcraft:** PTV reply to Smartbus proposal
- **Susan Jennison, Community:** Brimbank Council CACG representation; Grey Box Woodland construction activity; Private land acquisition; Development approvals; Insurance coverage.
- **Frank Rivoli, Community:** Property Values study statement; Hume Council resolution on 2013 Master Plan

5. Reports

Pre-meeting reports from Melbourne Airport, Airservices Australia and the Chair are provided with the agenda pack and reported by exception.

5.1 Work plan: status of actions

The Chair referred to the status of items listed in the written report. This report was **NOTED** and completed items will be deleted from future reports.

5.2 Noise Abatement Committee—Darrell Treloar, Independent Chair

A report of the Noise Abatement Committee meeting held on Monday 13 February was tabled. Discussion focused on Airservices processes for the receipt and collation of noise complaint data, which included:

- how complaints are recorded, i.e. complainants versus complaint numbers
- availability of voicemail function to recording complaints
- provision of additional suburb information in noise information reports.

It was **AGREED** the above issues be referred for discussion to the next meeting of the Noise Abatement Committee, scheduled for Monday 15 May.

This report was **NOTED**.

5.3 Melbourne Airport report—Michael Jarvis, Melbourne Airport

The Melbourne Airport report was tabled. This report was **NOTED**.

5.4 Airservices Australia report—Alby Goodsell, Airservices Australia

The Airservices Australia Report was tabled.

Major focus of discussion was on Airservices' and Melbourne Airport responses to the four noise abatement recommendations arising from the November CACG meeting.

Recommendation 1:

That national and international experience with noise abatement is investigated to identify lessons that could be applied at Melbourne Airport with a view to minimising the negative impact of noise on communities living adjacent to the airport.

Neil Hall, Airservices, explained that making like-for-like comparisons is not straightforward as each airport was different with varied runway configurations and fleet mixes. In an Australian context, Perth Airport was most similar to Melbourne as both are landlocked—unlike Brisbane and Sydney, where aircraft can be directed to fly over water to minimise noise for residents near those airports.

Internationally, it is similarly difficult to draw comparisons. Many airports operate parallel runways, have the benefit of open water, and operate in different regulatory environments. Heathrow, for example, 'owns' its flight paths to a certain height and can fine airlines if those height limits are contravened—this simply is not possible in Australia.

Airservices has looked at best practise examples and continues to do so—it just hasn't found any comparable examples. That is why it emphasises the use of noise abatement procedures as these are the best current solution to minimising population overflight.

Airservices continues to monitor best practise across the world and would be pleased to update the CACG in future on any developments in this area.

ACTION: Additional discussion on this recommendation to be put on the agenda for the Melbourne Airport CACG meeting in February 2018.

Recommendation 2:

That the Technical Noise and Environment Working Group be asked to consider if any improvements can be made to lessen the noise impact of departing aircraft, as experienced by residents living south of Runway 16, particularly at night.

Neil Hall, Airservices, said the Technical Noise and Environment Working Group had met prior to the CACG to discuss departures off Runway 16 and have committed to ongoing discussions at the group to consider what, if any, improvements might be possible.

ACTION: Additional discussion on this recommendation to be put on the agenda for the Melbourne Airport CACG meeting in February 2018.

Recommendation 3:

That more be done to promote the existence and application of noise abatement procedures at Melbourne Airport, including the availability of online tools to assist residents to understand what is happening and why.

Neil Hall, Airservices, said both Airservices and Melbourne Airport were happy with this recommendation and would work collaboratively to promote noise abatement procedures.

Neil Hall highlighted Airservices' updated website as a tool that could be promoted to the wider community. It had dedicated information portals for all capital city airports, including Melbourne Airport, and contained detailed information on airport operations, including noise monitoring and noise abatement procedures, flight paths, movements, runways and more.

The Melbourne Airport portal is available at: <http://aircraftnoiseinfo.bksv.com/melbourne/>



airservices Melbourne Airport

Home Movements Flight Paths Runways Investigations & Consultation Noise Monitoring Complaints

Home

Melbourne Airport is located around 20km north east of the central business district. The majority of operations at Melbourne Airport are international and domestic regular passenger services, mostly medium to large jets.

Melbourne Airport is curfew-free and operates 24 hours a day, however [noise abatement procedures](#) apply.

The airport manages up to 65 movements per hour. In 2015 Melbourne Airport averaged 645 movements a day.

Our easy-to-understand booklet, [Guide to our operations](#), provides explanation about how air traffic control works and insights into everyday occurrences at airports.

Use the menu above to explore information about movements, flight paths, runway use, complaints and more.



A screenshot of the Melbourne Airport information portal on Airservices' website.

Neil Hall, Airservices, also spoke of an information flyer produced at Brisbane Airport that was distributed to international airlines to raise awareness of the noise abatement procedures at Brisbane (domestic airlines are more aware of NAPs, hence the focus on internationals).

Neil suggested a similar flyer could be produced for Melbourne Airport and distributed to international airlines to make them aware / reinforce the NAPs that apply at Melbourne.

Frank Rivoli, Community: How do you force airlines to follow noise abatement procedures?

Neil Hall, Airservices: Airlines cannot be forced or fined for not following noise abatement procedures—financial penalties do not apply in Australia. What you can do is make them aware of the noise abatement procedures along with the expectation that they follow the procedures.

ACTION: Neil Hall to present on the Melbourne Airport information portal to the next CACG meeting.

Recommendation 4:

That the application of noise abatement procedures at Melbourne Airport be routinely monitored to assess compliance and demonstrate their effectiveness. This may require development of monitoring systems and/or the reporting format.

ACTION: This recommendation will be pursued at a future meeting.

This report was **NOTED**.

5.5 Chair's report—Darrell Treloar, Independent Chair

The Chairman referred to his written report and provided a verbal update on the recruitment of community members. He advised six applications were received and all candidates were invited to attend interviews. Five people were interviewed by a panel comprising Kris Perkovic, Major Winton Knop (Salvation Army Chaplain at Melbourne Airport) and himself.

All candidates were asked set questions, based on the selection criteria, and the following candidates were assessed as being most suitable (in no particular order) to fill the three vacancies:

- Fred Ackerman, resident of Taylors Lakes.
- David Cleland, resident of Greenvale.
- Peter Hurst, resident of Attwood.

The Chairman noted all three are proficient communicators, demonstrated an ability and willingness to devote time to the group and offer diverse skills and experience.

The information was noted and, there being no objection, it was **AGREED** Fred Ackerman, David Cleland and Peter Hurst be appointed community members of the CACG.

The Chairman highlighted his written report on the inquiry into the Airports Amendment Bill 2016 and the content of the draft Bill was discussed. It was **AGREED** a submission be made to the Senate Rural and Regional Affairs and Transport Legislation Committee, restating the group's views relating to:

- mandatory inclusion of alternative aircraft noise metrics in new master plans
- fixing the monetary trigger for requiring MDPs to be prepared, at no greater than \$25 million
- ensuring "creep" in the amount of the MDP monetary trigger does not occur as a consequence of the three yearly Ministerial review and that it is genuinely based on inflation over time.

The following recommendations in the written report were also **AGREED**. That:

- Mateja Rautner be thanked for her service to the CACG over the past four years.
- Leanne Deans and Brimbank City Council be thanked for their past contributions by providing a link between the NAC and the CACG.
- Marcello Alves and Ron Brent be thanked for their past support of the CACG and offered the group's best wishes for their new endeavours.
- Narelle Bell be congratulated on her recent appointment as the Aircraft Noise Ombudsman and invited to attend and address a future meeting of the group.

6 Aircraft Noise Abatement recommendations discussion—Darrell Treloar, Independent Chair

This agenda item was addressed in 'Item 5.4—Airservices Australia report'.

7 Work program update—Darrell Treloar, Chair

The Chair referred to the Work Program Update report and accompanying attachment.

It was **AGREED** a CACG Strategy day be held on 18 April 2017, commencing at 9:00 am, and that further consideration be given to the draft work program on that day.

ACTION: Work Program update to be considered at the CACG Strategy Day on 18 April 2017.

8 Impact of aircraft noise on Melbourne residential property values (Property Values Study)—Chris Eves, Professor of Property, School of Property, Construction & Project Management, RMIT

A Property Values study summary report was tabled at the pre-meeting. The study looked at the impact of aircraft noise on property values in suburbs around Melbourne Airport and across the metropolitan area. It covered 320,000 residential property sales for 62 suburbs in 19 local government areas over a 25-year period from 1990 to 2015.

The study looks specifically at the impact of aircraft noise on residential property values around the airport and across metropolitan Melbourne. It covered 320,000 residential property sales for 62 suburbs around Melbourne over a 25-year period from 1990 to 2015. Suburbs that have no aircraft noise exposure through to those with more aircraft noise exposure including suburbs under established flight paths, were included as part of the study. The study is the same methodology used by Brisbane Airport.

The study was undertaken by Property Economics Professor Chris Eves, formerly of the Queensland University of Technology but now at RMIT's School of Property, Construction and Project Management. Professor Eves has expertise in this field of research, having previously undertaken a property values study for both Brisbane and Gold Coast airports.

Frank Rivoli, Community queried why the property values study did not factor in the Melbourne Airport Environment Overlay as this would limit development and therefore impact on investment growth and property values.

Chris Eves explained the study focus is on long term investment performance using several comparison metrics, of which N- contours is one. The Melbourne Airport Environs Overlay is a planning control, much like other planning controls such as bushfire and heritage overlays. Planning controls can be viewed as either a good thing or a bad thing, depending on your perspective.

Frank Rivoli, Community stated that other international studies show aircraft noise does impact on property values, mentioning a Jones Lang LaSalle study that suggested a negative impact on properties of minus 3 to minus 15 percent, depending on ANEF location.

Chris Eves was aware of the study in question and that this, along with other similar studies, was included in the literature review of the Property Values study. There were several studies based on 'hedonic price modelling', which involves analysis of sales data over a typical period

of six months to two years and based on sales of 100 properties. This gives a very short term picture of investment performance in contrast to this study, which analysed 320,000 sales over a 27-year period.

9 Other business

9.1 Green Wedge coalition / Noise complaint reporting—David O'Connor, Community

David O'Connor requested that consideration be given to extending an invitation to the Green Wedge Coalition to become a member of the CACG.

ACTION: Request to be discussed at the CACG Strategy day on 18 April 2017.

David O'Connor queried if Airservices would reconsider its position of reporting only complainants in contrast to total number of complaints as this was a policy not favoured by many residents. He provided context by stating there was a push by some community members to establish an independent noise complaints body that would report back directly to the CACG.

Neil Hall, Airservices, explained that the software used by Airservices' Noise Complaints and Investigations Service (NCIS) did not allow for the reporting of multiple complaints by the same person for the same complaint.

ACTION: Noise complaint reporting to be considered on an ongoing basis at the Noise Abatement Committee.

9.2 Smartbus proposal correspondence—Jack Medcraft, AMAC

Jack Medcraft asked if there was a reply from Public Transport Victoria to a letter from the CACG seeking feedback on a proposal from Hume resident Stephen Coughlan on the extension of the 901 SmartBus service from Melbourne Airport to Sunbury.

ACTION: Chair to write to PTV requesting a reply to original correspondence.

9.3 Brimbank Council CACG representation—Susan Jennison, Community

Susan Jennison asked that it be noted that Brimbank City councillor Virginia Tachos is seeking a position on the CACG and for this request to be considered by the group.

ACTION: Place on agenda at the CACG Strategy day on 18 April 2017

9.4 Greybox Woodland construction activity—Susan Jennison, Community

Susan Jennison enquired about construction activity at a protected area of Greybox Woodland (near Gate 4), including sightings of trucks travelling through the area and wanted confirmation as to what this activity might be?

It was suggested that the activity might be related to a nearby concrete batching plant.

ACTION: Melbourne Airport to report back to the CACG to confirm the type of activity and if trucks were using the Woodland for access.

9.5 Development approvals—Susan Jennison, Community

Susan Jennison wanted to know about the decision making process in approving warehouse developments close to the terminal, particularly in light of the disaster at Essendon Airport.

Michael Jarvis, Melbourne Airport explained that developments went through a thorough and very detailed risk assessment process before they were included in a Major Development Plan

9.6 Land acquisition / Insurance coverage—Susan Jennison, Community

Susan Jennison sought confirmation if acquisition of private land was for the purpose of runway expansion.

Kerr Forbes, Melbourne Airport, confirmed that a recent advertisement announcing a land acquisition process was for the expansion of the runway system, which included the extension of the existing runway and proposed construction of a new third runway.

As a result of the tragedy at Essendon Airport, Susan Jennison highlighted concerns in regards to insurance coverage in the event of an aircraft-related accident. Susan wanted included on the public record her concern that insurance companies could refuse to pay out on claims, for example, an aircraft tyre damaging a residence in the vicinity of the airport.

9.6 Hume City Council report on Melbourne Airport 2013 Master Plan—Frank Rivoli, Community

Frank Rivoli raised an item regarding a Hume City Council report from 2013 on Melbourne Airport's 2013 Master Plan. Frank cited part of the report, which suggested Hume City Council supported community input into third runway alignment options.

Darrell Treloar, Chair, queried the relevance of the statement, as the Master Plan consultation process had concluded long ago. Melbourne Airport itself had provided a presentation on the east-west orientation decision at this very meeting 12 months ago, which was attended by Frank and other CACG members present at the meeting today.

Meeting closed at 6pm.

Next meeting: to be held on Tuesday 16 May 2017 4pm–6pm at Salvation Army Brimbank City Corps, 2A Roseleigh Boulevard, Sydenham

Community Aviation Consultation Group: Action Items Report, February 2017

Mtg	Subject	Lead	Status	Action
2011 Work Plan	4 Warehouse Major Development Plans.	Melbourne Airport	The MDP for Warehouse 1, a 100,000sqm site on Link Road, was approved by the Minister for Infrastructure and Transport on 23 August 2016. The MDP for Warehouse 2, a 40,000sqm site on Airport Drive, was approved by the Minister on 31 Dec 2016.	Melbourne Airport to keep CACG informed of the progress of MDPs for sites 3 and 4.
19 May 2015	CALD community engagement on the RDP.	Melbourne Airport	Melbourne Airport considering several CALD community engagement options.	Action: RDP CALD community engagement update to be provided at May 2017 CACG meeting
17 Nov 2015	Priorities listed in the CACG work program to be addressed at future meetings.	Chair	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Recommendations regarding noise abatement procedures referred to Melbourne Airport and Airservices. Runway Development Program currently being addressed. CACG briefed on RDP health study at November 2016 meeting. 	<p>The following are listed for future attention:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Community health Curfews and noise sharing Inappropriate development Ground transport.
17 Nov 2015	Consideration of changes to the CACG Terms of Reference.	Chair	Federal Government's response to the Orima review has been released and a copy of the amended CACG guidelines provided to members.	Review ToR and consider changes in 2017. (See report for item 7 at this meeting)
16 Feb 2016	Victorian government safeguarding measures.	DELWP		A more detailed presentation on Victorian Government safeguarding measures will be included in the future CACG consideration of 'inappropriate development'.
17 May 2016	CACG to extend invitation to RMIT planning expert, Professor Michael Buxton, to speak at a future pre-meeting when	Chair		Invitation to be extended —date and time to be determined.

Mtg	Subject	Lead	Status	Action
	'curfews and noise sharing' are listed on the agenda.			
16 August 2016	CACG to discuss proposal from Hume resident Stephen Coughlan regarding the extension of the 901 SmartBus service from Melbourne Airport to Sunbury.	Chair	Letter from Chair sent to Public Transport Victoria seeking advice on any plans to extend 901 Smartbus service to Sunbury. Update: Follow up correspondence sent to PTV CEO Jeroen Weimar.	Consider proposal when response from PTV is received.
15 Nov 2016	Presentation on Melbourne Airport's disaster planning arrangements	Chair	.	Melbourne Airport Emergency Management team member to present on airport disaster planning arrangements.
15 Nov 2016	Survey CACG public meeting attendees	Melbourne Airport		Conduct phone survey of people from the community who have attended CACG meetings for their opinion on what they like / do not like about the CACG.
21 Feb 2017	Airservices' Melbourne Airport information portal	Airservices		Neil Hall to present on the Melbourne Airport information portal to the May CACG meeting.
21 Feb 2017	Ongoing monitoring of noise abatement procedures	Airservices		List for update report and further consideration at February 2018 meeting.
21 Feb 2017	Confirmation on construction/vehicle activity at a protected area of Greybox Woodland	Melbourne Airport		Report findings of enquiries regarding construction activity and if trucks were using the Greybox Woodland for access, to May 2017 meeting.